

Serial No.: 09/735,930

The Examiner stated that Chattha differs “in that it does not contemplate using alkali metal, but teaches this as an option.” Office Action, page 2. Actually, Chattha very clearly teaches away from using an alkali metal: “The alkali metal and alkaline earth metals which are typically utilized for NOx sorption have, however, the serious drawback that they are readily poisoned by sulfur in the exhaust gas.” Chattha, col. 2, lines 1-4.

There is no motivation to modify the teachings of Chattha by utilizing an alkali metal in sulfur-free feedstreams, because Chattha itself does not teach or suggest such a feedstream. Chattha in fact teaches that “[m]ost fuels for automotive vehicles contain sulfur.” Chattha, col. 2, lines 4-5. Applicants’ invention utilizes an alkali metal, which Chattha fails to teach or suggest, and indeed warns against. Based on Chattha, one of ordinary skill in the art would have been motivated to avoid alkali metal, not modify Chattha’s teachings with it.

Chattha does not disclose every element of claim 12, and furthermore, there is no motivation to modify the teachings of Chattha in the way suggested by the Examiner. For at least the reasons described above, the rejection should be withdrawn and claim 12 should be allowed. Claims 14 and 15 depend from claim 12 and should therefore be allowed for at least the reasons described above.

Applicants respectfully request that the rejection be withdrawn and all claims 12, 14, and 15 be allowed to issue.


The PTO is hereby authorized to charge or credit any necessary fees to Deposit Account No. 19-4293. Should the Examiner deem that any further amendments would be desirable in placing this application in even better condition for issue, he is invited to telephone applicant’s undersigned representative.

Serial No.: 09/735,930

Respectfully submitted,

STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP

Date: September 11, 2006

 *Reg. No. 41,478*
Roger W. Parkhurst
Registration No. 25,177
C. Donald Stevens
Registration No. 53,638

RWP/CDS/cd

Old Attorney Docket No. WATK:205
New Attorney Docket No.: 28953.7205

STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP
1330 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036-1795
Tel: (202) 429-3000
Fax: (202) 429-3902